



Comparison of Harmonious Labor Relations Governance of Local Governments under the Perspective of Local Adaptation--Taking Yantian District of Shenzhen City and Jining City of Shandong Province as Examples

Xingyu Hu ^a, Jing Chen ^{*}

School of Management, Chengdu University of Information Technology, Chengdu, 610103, China

^a Sherryhu0120@163.com (X.H.); ^{*} jchjoy@cuit.edu.cn (J.C.)

Abstract. As an important part of production relations, the degree of harmony in labor relations is inextricably linked to the degree of social harmony, and then how the government governs labor relations has become one of the core issues in the study of labor relations. However, different regional governments have different specific strategies for building harmonious labor relations. Based on the experience of eight regions in the 2019 pilot project of the Ministry of Human Resources and Social Security to deepen the comprehensive reform of building harmonious labor relations, this thesis selects Yantian District in Shenzhen and Jining City in Shandong Province as the research objects, and takes the concept of "tailored to the local conditions and precise implementation of policies" as the perspective of governance, starting from the industrial characteristics of Yantian District and the brand building of Jining City, the study compares the governance of Yantian District with that of Jining City in terms of governmental roles, policies and regulations, coordinating mechanisms, and labor disputes resolution, and reveals the highlights of the governments of the two places in terms of harmonious labor relations governance according to their own realities, with the aim of providing references and lessons to promote the governance of labor relations across the country.

Keywords: harmonious labor relations; local government; locally adapted; comparative governance; Yantian District; Jining City

1 Introduction

As one of the most basic and important social relations, whether or not labor relations are harmonious has a bearing on economic development and social harmony. With the continuous development of the economy and society, the form, content and theoretical system of labor relations in China have been constantly innovated[1], and these changes have not only brought challenges to the governance of labor relations in the new era, but also raised new issues for the construction of harmonious labor relations and the

realization of social harmony and stability[2]. And in promoting the construction of harmonious labor relations, the key to achieving the effectiveness of governance is to tailor the policy to the local conditions and precision. 2019, the Ministry of Human Resources and Social Affairs has determined that in eight areas, including the Binhai New Area in Tianjin, the Suzhou Industrial Park, Fuzhou City in Fujian Province, Jingdezhen City in Jiangxi Province, Jining City in Shandong Province, Yantian District in Shenzhen, Jiulongpo District in Chongqing, and Xindu District in Chengdu, the comprehensive matching reforms for building harmonious labor relations will be carried out, allowing different pilot areas to address their different labor relations problems and adopt corresponding governance strategies based on local realities under the guidance of unified policies at the higher level. Overall, the pilot regions are guided by the "accelerating the improvement of the working system led by the Party committee, responsible by the government, coordinated by the society, with the participation of enterprises and employees, and safeguarded by the rule of law," which was put forward in the Opinions on Building Harmonious Labor Relations issued by the Central Committee of the Communist Party of China (CPC) and the State Council in 2015[3]. This paper chooses Yantian District in Shenzhen and Jining City in Shandong Province for analysis and comparison because Shenzhen is the window of reform and opening up and is at the forefront of economic development, while Jining City in Shandong Province is one of the important birthplaces of the Chinese civilization and Confucianism, with a rich history and culture, and both of them are representative of the local conditions. Yantian District in Shenzhen aims to build a model city for harmonious labor relations, relying on the status quo of local social development, guiding social forces to participate in an orderly manner, promoting collaborative social governance, and forming a "Yantian Sample" for building harmonious labor relations; while Jining City in Shandong Province adheres to the harmonious concept of "harmony, harmony and co-existence", rooting it in labor relations, promoting the establishment of the "Harmony" brand of labor dispute prevention and mediation, and creating the "Jining Model" of building harmonious labor relations.

2 Adapting to local conditions: the governance practices of the two governments in terms of precise policy-making

2.1 Industrial Characteristics: Forming a "Yantian Sample" for Building Harmonious Labor Relations

Yantian District put forward the concept of "Harmonious Labor Relations Urban Area" and started to create a model urban area for harmonious labor relations in 2011. In the long-term process of building harmonious labor relations, Yantian District has formed a set of harmonious labor relations governance system through exploring new ideas and methods, relying on industrial characteristics, actively developing industrial associations and mobilizing social organizations, and providing a model for building harmonious labor relations around the world.

Creating an industry association for the promotion of harmonious labor relations and innovating consultation mechanisms.

Relying on the clearer industry structure in the area, Yantian District created the Harmonious Labor Relations Promotion Association in 2015, the first non-profit social organization voluntarily formed by enterprises and social groups in China, which mainly provides enterprises in the district with services such as labor policy propaganda, labor relations management, labor law consulting, and mediation of labor disputes, and helps enterprises and employees resolve labor disputes from the perspective of a social organization. The establishment of the Harmonious Labor Relations Promotion Association has brought considerable results to the governance of harmonious labor relations in Yantian District. On the one hand, it reduces labor disputes at source, prevents labor conflicts, and promotes and realizes the forward movement of the gate of harmonious labor relations; on the other hand, the association carries out the evaluation of enterprises with harmonious labor relations and all kinds of flexible services, which creates a strong culture of harmonious labor relations and establishes the value of "win-win situation for both employers and employees"; and most importantly, the association effectively resolves labor disputes, and helps enterprises and employees resolve labor disputes from the perspective of social organizations. Most importantly, the association has effectively resolved labor disputes and reduced the number of labor dispute arbitration cases[4].

The coordination mechanism for labor relations has long been a necessary policy instrument to promote harmonious, stable and healthy development of labor relations[5]. Therefore, once the association was established, the Yantian government established mechanisms for collective consultation and industry services at the industry level, and the governance of labor relations based on industry enterprises is mainly based on enterprises with industrial characteristics in the region, including the port transportation industry, the loading and unloading industry, and so on[6]. Taking the port transportation industry as an example, the Hong Kong Transportation Workers' Federation, established in 2007, has gradually established a long-term mechanism for collective consultation in the industry for work positions, remuneration, labor relations, rest time, etc. since the start of the industry collective consultation work in 2011; since 2016, the remuneration diversity model has been gradually built, and since 2017, the collective consultation in the Yantian port transportation industry has basically realized the industry's full coverage of jobs; the collective consultation work in this industry has greatly improved the increasingly tense and complex labor relations since its implementation; during 2011-2018, the efficiency of the entire industry has steadily improved, the wages of employees have increased by more than 20% or more on average, and disputes triggered by income have shrunk by 13% year-on-year compared to the previous period[7]. In addition, for the gold jewelry industry, which is more concentrated in Yantian District, the local Human Resources and Social Security Bureau has promoted the construction of standards and diagnostic services for harmonious labor relations, and urged enterprises in the industry that are prone to labor disputes to revise their rules and regulations, which has improved their compliance in labor relations[8].

Establishment of the country's first public service center for labor relations.

In 2018, Yantian District set up the country's first public service center for labor relations, whose main responsibility is to provide a number of services centered on employment and entrepreneurship, including improving management systems, providing policy guidance, guiding social forces to help and regulating the use of labor by enterprises. It guides grassroots and fosters professional organizations and other joint employment and entrepreneurship services through targeted monitoring, skills training and special subsidies. In addition, the center also guides industries and enterprises to establish a sound labor relations coordination and consultation mechanism to resolve labor relations conflicts and disputes through consultation and mediation. At the same time, Yantian District also issued the "Yantian District Labor Relations Public Service Matters List", established a product research and development mechanism involving the government, trade unions and enterprises, and launched a number of innovative service products, such as "commissioned mediation of labor disputes", "risk diagnosis of labor relations", "one case, one lesson, one suggestion" and "mobile arbitration tribunal", with the concepts of "demand-oriented, customer-oriented, product-conscious, user-experienced, and performance-evaluating", thus initially realizing the hierarchical and categorized system of the "Product Supermarket". In 2020, Yantian set up the first public service station for labor relations in industrial parks in China in the Dabaihui Life and Health Industrial Park, which maximally integrates human resources, trade unions, streets, communities and other relevant public service organizations in Yantian district, in order to perform grassroots public service and achieve all-round sharing of the fruits of harmonious labor relations, realize all-round sharing of the fruits of harmonious labor relations.

2.2 Brand Building: Creating the "Jining Model" of Harmonious Labor Relations Construction

Jining City, as the birthplace of Confucian culture, has implemented the harmonious concepts of "harmony, harmony and co-existence" into the construction of labor relations, and has made certain achievements in attracting and educating talents, stabilizing employment, safeguarding labor rights and interests, and providing public services, etc. As early as 2014, Jining City became the only city in the province to create a pilot city with harmonious labor relations. Nowadays, the creation of harmonious labor relations has become a broad consensus in all walks of life, and in Jining, the hometown of Confucius and Mencius, the creation of harmonious labor relations has become an important part of building a harmonious Jining. Jining City has taken brand building as its centerpiece, continued to innovate in the application of traditional culture, and focused on breakthroughs in key areas in an effort to create a "Jining Model" of harmonious labor relations.

Building the "Harmony" brand of labor dispute prevention and mediation.

Jining City has always been committed to inheriting, developing and promoting outstanding traditional culture in the construction of harmonious labor relations, rooting it

in labor relations and giving it new connotations for the times. Therefore, Jining City has made the following efforts in the construction of the "Harmony" labor dispute prevention and mediation brand. First, there are two government-led positions: the first is the "Harmony" Social Governance Service Center. In September 2020, Jining City set up the "Harmony" Social Governance Service Center at the city, county and village levels by integrating resources, innovating mechanisms and re-engineering processes. The purpose of this initiative is to integrate the power of conflict mediation and resolution, to realize the "one-stop reception, package mediation, and full chain solution" of conflict disputes, and to incorporate labor dispute mediation into the work system. Secondly, the establishment of the "Harmony" mediation room. Since 2015, Jining City has set up a mediation room in some townships and villages (communities), realizing that "small matters do not go out of the village, and big matters do not go out of the town" through mediation and negotiation. The city has also formulated the Standardized Management Measures for Harmony Mediation Rooms, and by the end of 2021, the city had built a total of 4,711 Harmony Mediation Rooms, with full coverage at the city, county and village levels, and a mediation success rate of more than 98.5%[9]. Then there are two platforms jointly built with social forces: the first is the formation of "labor dispute prevention and mediation mission". In April 2020, Jining City set up the Labor Dispute Prevention and Mediation Advocacy Team, which is composed of professionals from labor dispute arbitration, social security, employment, labor supervision and law firms, mediation experts, and corporate human resource managers. The team is committed to regulating the employment of enterprises and reducing labor disputes through online and offline training. The second is the establishment of the Labor Dispute Prevention and Mediation Alliance. In October 2020, the Jining City Human Resources and Social Security Bureau established a working alliance with more than 30 chambers of commerce (associations) in the city, covering more than 2,000 enterprises, and established a mechanism for the co-construction and collaboration of risk prevention and control of labor and employment, forming a working pattern of multi-dimensional prevention and control in the mediation of labor disputes.

Establishment of a joint mediation center for labor disputes.

In addition to actively building the "Harmony" brand, in June 2020, the Jining Bureau of Human Resources and Social Security established a joint labor dispute mediation center with the People's Court, the Judicial Bureau and the Federation of Trade Unions. The center aims to undertake early warning and prevention of labor disputes, pre-arbitration mediation and mediation work entrusted by arbitration agencies, as well as assisting in the promotion of labor laws and regulations. This joint mediation center complements the "Harmony" brand of labor dispute prevention and mediation, with the former governing all types of labor disputes from the perspective of legal compliance through the joint efforts of administrative departments, and the latter guiding the participation of social forces by administrative departments in dealing with all types of labor disputes from the perspective of reasonableness and rationality, based on the premise of legal compliance. As a result of the establishment of these two organizations, in 2020, the city's mediation and settlement rate of labor and personnel dispute

cases reached 77.7%, and the number of labor dispute cases dropped by 24.3% year-on-year. In addition, the Jining People's Mediation Committee for Labor and Personnel Disputes was named "National Model People's Mediation Committee"[10].

Establishment of the province's first comprehensive labor relations service station.

In the area of public services, Jining City has innovated a grass-roots labor relations public service system. In April 2020, the first comprehensive labor relations service station in Shandong Province was established at the Datang Gaohong Zhihui Center in Rencheng District, Jining City. The service station took the lead in putting forward the concept of "building autonomy", established the "building Xiaoe" service commissioner, and formed the "three lists", "nine deliberations" and other management systems. In addition, it has planned and carried out activities such as the "Talent Night Market" and "Policy Cloud Classroom", providing precise, one-stop guidance and services in response to the needs of enterprises for labor and employment management, labor dispute mediation, talent recruitment services, and consulting on policies that benefit enterprises. These initiatives have promoted "self-management, self-mediation and self-service" among enterprises and employees, and have been widely praised by the people in the business building. At the same time, a comprehensive labor relations service station has been set up in Haineng E-commerce Park, which is based on the development of e-commerce industry. The experience and practices of the station in recent years have been promoted by the central government and the provincial tripartite coordination of labor relations, and the station has been listed as one of the first grassroots labor relations public service model stations in the country in 2023. The establishment of the service station is a reflection of Jining City's active exploration and promotion of the extension and sinking of public services for labor relations to the grassroots level, and also marks the substantive advancement stage of Jining City's pilot project to deepen the comprehensive and supporting reforms for the construction of harmonious labor relations across the country.

3 Comparative Reference: Exploring the Path of Harmonious Labor Relations Governance in the Two Places

In terms of building harmonious labor relations, both governments rely on the actual situation in their respective regions to implement governance. In Yantian District, industrial associations are established based on industrial characteristics, and a consultation mechanism is constructed to realize the construction of harmonious labor relations; while in Jining City, traditional Confucian civilization is rooted in governance based on the city's historical and cultural heritage, and labor disputes are resolved in order to build harmonious labor relations. Based on the practical experience of these two places, it is useful to explore their commonalities and individualized means of governance, which will be useful for other local governments to refer to when carrying out their governance.

3.1 Positive Incentives and Negative Constraints: Building a Governance System with Multi-party Social Participation

Constructing a scientific and reasonable evaluation index system for harmonious labor relations among enterprises and measuring the degree of harmony in labor relations are of great significance for promoting the sustainable development of enterprises and building a harmonious socialist society[11]. As can be seen from the above practical experience, both governments have actively guided social forces to participate in governance. By reducing punitive measures against enterprises and strengthening incentive mechanisms, in order to encourage enterprises to actively participate in the construction of harmonious labor relations. For example, Yantian District has issued official evaluation standards, drafted and improved the Yantian District Harmonious Labor Relations Enterprise Evaluation Indicator System and the Yantian District Harmonious Labor Relations Advanced Enterprises Evaluation Measures, which point out the objectives, methods and paths for building harmonious labor relations among enterprises. At the same time, a commendation meeting for advanced enterprises in harmonious labor relations was organized to encourage more advanced enterprises to play an exemplary leading role and promote the industry's ability to enhance harmonious labor relations. Jining City has also established the Evaluation Criteria for Enterprises with Harmonious Labor Relations in Jining City and formulated the corresponding Measures for Evaluation and Management of Enterprises with Harmonious Labor Relations in Jining City based on the criteria. In the Measures, Jining City has clearly defined incentives, including limited arrangements for financial capital projects, white-listed credit, and green channels for tax-related matters, etc., in order to attract more enterprises to build harmonious labor relations.

3.2 Stronger linkage and weaker fragmentation: establishment of a multi-sectoral linkage processing mechanism

Optimizing participation mechanisms and building participation platforms are key ways to achieve innovative practices in the social governance system. By building platforms, the two governments have organically linked the public sector and private institutions, weakened fragmented treatment, and jointly managed labor dispute disputes. First, the private sector leads and assists the public sector's working mechanism. Take the Association for the Promotion of Harmonious Labor Relations in Yantian District as an example, which is a social organization within the industry established under the guidance of the government, and is responsible for resolving labor dispute disputes within the industry on its own. Although the association is not completely separate from the government, it acts as a bridge between the government and enterprises and workers, cooperating with the government in publicizing labor laws and regulations and carrying out "mobile arbitration tribunals" in order to give full play to its role. Second, the public sector and the private sector are complementing each other. The Labor Dispute Mediation Center in Jining City, for example, it is mainly led by the tripartite parties in labor relations, and is complemented by other institutions and organizations under the "Harmony" brand of prevention and mediation of labour disputes, so as to achieve ex

ante prevention, ex post control and ex post governance, thus effectively embodying the superiority of the linkage mechanism. In short, the pilot areas have achieved remarkable results in building harmonious labor relations by optimizing participation mechanisms, building participation platforms and strengthening the linkage between the public and private sectors, providing useful reference for harmonious labor relations governance throughout the country.

3.3 More coverage, less omission: realizing full coverage of public services in labor relations

After the realization of harmonious labor relations governance, how to ensure its continuous maintenance has become the key to the continued efforts of the governments of the two places. First, we can learn from the experience of Yantian District in setting up a labor relations service center, a public service platform that integrates labor relations-related content into a single platform, making it easy for enterprises and workers to solve problems and enjoy services in a "one-stop" manner. In addition, according to their actual situation, they have set up public service stations in fixed office premises, so that labor relations services can reach the front line. For example, Jining City has set up a comprehensive labor relations service station in a commercial office building, with a dedicated staff to solve labor relations problems in the first instance, and to disseminate new regulations and policies to enterprises and workers in a timely manner, so as to help enterprises regulate labor and employment more closely.

4 Conclusion

This paper takes Yantian District of Shenzhen and Jining City of Shandong Province, one of the eight pilot districts of the Ministry of Human Resources and Social Security, as the objects of study, and through comparative analysis of the governance experiences of the two pilot districts, it reveals the common and individualized governance strategies of the governments of the two districts according to their own realities from the viewpoint of tailoring to the needs of the local conditions. The strategy choice of the local governments needs to be in line with the overall direction and requirements of the higher-level reforms, as well as the current economic development of the pilot areas, i.e., what are the more suitable ways and means to achieve the construction of harmonious labor relations. In addition, the pilot government will also make innovations according to its own actual situation, such as the industrial layout, the current situation of the industry division area and the economic and cultural influence. Yantian District in Shenzhen builds harmonious labor relations based on its economic development status and industrial characteristics, while Jining City in Shandong Province builds the brand of "Harmony" labor dispute prevention and mediation based on its profound historical and cultural heritage. By studying the commonality and individuality of the two governments' strategies, we can see the innovations and efforts made by the governing bodies to build harmonious labor relations, and we can also learn from them the idea of

adapting to local conditions, which is helpful for other local governments to make appropriate strategies in building harmonious labor relations.

References

1. Yang Y.X. The Construction of Labor Relation Theory in the Process of Chinese Path to Modernization[J]. *Journal of Xi'an University of Finance and Economics*,2023,36(04):12-21.
DOI:10.3969/j.issn.1672-2817.2023.04.002.
2. Li G.C.; Ding X.D. The Theoretical Origin,Ideological Connotation and Practical Value of Xi Jinping's Important Discourse on Building Harmonious Labour Relations[J]. *Academic Journal of Zhongzhou*,2023(05):12-19. DOI:10.3969/j.issn.1003-0751.2023.05.003.
3. China.gov.cn. Opinions of the CPC Central Committee and State Council on building harmonious labor relations [EB/OL]. (2015-03-21). https://www.gov.cn/guowuyuan/2015-04/08/content_2843938.htm
4. Zeng X.L.; Hua S.S. Practical Exploration of Social Organizations' Participation in Labor Relations Governance in the Context of Co-Governance--Taking Shenzhen Yantian District Harmonious Labor Relations Promotion Association as an Example[J]. *Journal of China Institute of Labor Relations*,2019,33(05):68-75. DOI:CNKI:SUN:GHLJ.0.2019-05-008
5. Sun H.; Ben F. The Evolutionary Logic and Basic Experience of the Coordination Mechanism of Labor Relations in New China [J]. *Seeking Truth*,2023,50(02):72-80.
DOI:10.19667/j.cnki.cn23-1070/c.2023.02.007.
6. Yuan J. Exploring the Practice of Labor Relations Governance with Chinese Characteristics in the New Era--A Case Study Based on Yantian District of Shenzhen[J]. *Shenzhen Social Science*,2019(02):76-86. DOI: CNKI:SUN:SZKX.0.2019-02-009
7. Yi L.M. Research on Collective Consultation Mechanism in Port Transportation Industry -- Taking the Port Transportation Industry in Yantian District of Shenzhen as an Example [D]. Hubei: Huazhong University of Science and Technology,2019. DOI: 10.27157/d.cnki.ghzku.2019.001490
8. Meng Q.; Yan Y. Energetic governance and social bonding: Strategic choices in the pilot government governance of labor relations[J].*China Human Resource Development*,2022,39(05):25-42.
DOI:10.16471/j.cnki.11-2822/c.2022.5.002
9. Jining civilization network. Jining creates a "peace as a precious" social governance model [EB/OL]. (2022-05-31). http://sdjn.wenming.cn/wmcscj/202205/t20220531_7642334.html
10. Jia P.; Liang Y. Cultural infiltration, collaborative governance, mediation first - the city actively builds "and for the noble" labor dispute prevention and mediation brand[N]. *Jining Daily*, 2021-05-26(5). http://www.jn001.com/paperpc/content/content_70164.html
11. Zhang Y.; Ni J.H. Construction of Evaluation Index System of Harmonious Labor Relations in Chinese Enterprises: An Empirical Analysis Based on Structural Equation Model[J]. *Sustainability* 2023, 15(20), 14657. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su152014657>.

Open Access This chapter is licensed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>), which permits any noncommercial use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons license and indicate if changes were made.

The images or other third party material in this chapter are included in the chapter's Creative Commons license, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material. If material is not included in the chapter's Creative Commons license and your intended use is not permitted by statutory regulation or exceeds the permitted use, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright holder.

