

YouTube as Digital Learning Resources for Teaching Bilingual Young Learners

Ni Kadek Meri Listiani¹, Ni Komang Arie Suwastini^{1*}, Gede Rasben Dantes²,
Ni Luh Putu Sri Adnyani¹, I Gusti Agung Sri Rwa Jayantin³

¹ English Language Education Department, Post Graduate Program, Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha, Singaraja, Indonesia

² Computer Science Department, Post Graduate Program, Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha, Singaraja, Indonesia

³ English Department, Universitas Mahasaraswati Denpasar, Indonesia

*Corresponding author. Email: arie.suwastini@undiksha.ac.id

ABSTRACT

As YouTube has become an integral part of the students' daily social media consumption, the present study argues that it can also be a valuable language learning source. Following George's (2008) model of Library Research and Aveyard's (2010) concept of Systematic Literary review, the present study selected and synthesise previous research and experts' opinion on the use of social media and YouTube for teaching English to young bilingual learners to propose the benefits of using YouTube as a medium for second language learning. YouTube has generally deemed a useful learning resource for young learners, and studies have highlighted the positive impacts of using YouTube to improve young learners' English skills. However, experts and researchers are also concerned about the weaknesses and threats posed by YouTube as a learning source for teaching English for young learners. These are prerequisite stable internet connection to access YouTube, irrelevant ads that cut in the middle of the videos, and next-videos suggestions that are not always relevant with the learning material in focus. Thus, while YouTube can be a useful learning resource, strategies to tackle its weaknesses are needed to optimise the benefits of using YouTube as a learning source for young learners.

Keywords: *Bilingual, Learning Source, Young Learners, YouTube*

1. INTRODUCTION

The use of Information and Communication Technology (ICT) in daily life influences the education field to involve digital technology in learning activities [44], [45], [41], [1], [40]. According to [2], digital technologies are often associated with social media such as YouTube, Instagram, Facebook, etc. that can be accessed easily through people's gadgets. Social media is an online platform for people to communicate, learn, collaborate, share daily activities, and stay connected with people worldwide [3]. Social media have been used as a media for teaching and learning to improve student skills in particular speaking, listening, writing and reading skills [40], both in traditional or modern approaches [4], and some have proven that social media can improve language learning [32], [6].

Reference [7] note that young learners must be introduced to educational video content that can help vary the learning process have beneficial features in the

academic field, linking the curriculum to real-life experiences and strengthening student motivation with new technologies. Using videos in learning activities can modernise and upgrade the lessons better [38]. Thus, the videos needed to teach young learners should be easy and fast to access to find the related topic with the material learned in the classroom [4], [8]. YouTube provides content that suitable for teaching and learning English effectively, and the videos are fascinating to watch [7], [4], [20]. Besides, unless they want the premium service, people do not need to pay for watching YouTube videos, and they only need to download the YouTube application on the play store or open their google and enter the YouTube site for free.

Several studies confirmed that YouTube is one of the beneficial language learning teaching tools because it has various types of learning videos and is categorised as a rich source of teaching materials for young bilingual students [4], [11], [14], [7], [19], [16], [25], [20]. On the contrary, some studies found the complication and issues

in implementing YouTube videos as learning resources in teaching English [34], [33]. Therefore, it is essential to examine social media's use in teaching. This present study specifically aims at elaborating what YouTube is and how it can be considered a good digital source for language learners, especially for young bilingual learners.

2. METHODOLOGY

This study was a literature review wherein the articles relevant to the research topic were reviewed and summarised in paragraphs [48]. This study examined related relevant research to YouTube in education in selected scientific journals from 2010 to 2020 indexed by Sinta 2 – Sinta 1 and Scopus. Literature review which is carried out systematically and with a documentation process can become a research methodology in a study [48]. The keywords used for selecting related articles were bilingual, learning source, young learners, YouTube Videos for Young Learners' Vocabulary, YouTube for Listening Comprehension Performance, and YouTube's Effect on Students' Learning Outcomes, Satisfaction, Self-Improvement.

3. FINDINGS & DISCUSSIONS

3.1. The Overview of YouTube

YouTube is a famous video-sharing website that allows its users to cooperate, watch, collaborate videos created in February 2005 by Jawed Karim, Steve Chen, Chad Hurley. They were the three former PayPal employees [3], [17]. YouTube grows up as the most popular site in 2006 with more than 65,000 new video uploads and the third most visited website by users all over the world after Google and Facebook [17], [2]. In YouTube, users can comment, reply to comments from other users, click the like and dislike buttons, and share videos to several social media accounts [15]. Users and companies make videos on YouTube of various types [3]. YouTube is a place to watch videos for free and only requires an internet connection to access the site for users to view and upload videos [3], [10].

As a video sharing community, Strangelove (2010) indicated YouTube loads and posts private videos, commercials, music videos, historical, classic clips, television shows, education videos, science, and many more that will work with a one-click button. Miller (2010) explained how YouTube works by uploading the video files in QuickTime, AVI, MPEG, or Windows Media Video (WMV) formats: how it only needs Macromedia Flash Player to be installed to enjoy streaming YouTube videos. Videos that have been uploaded can be watched by visiting the channel or searching the search column. On the other hand, to upload a video, a YouTube account is required. This

YouTube account will also allow users to save favourite videos, make playlists, join groups and communities, like or dislike videos, and subscribe to favourite channels [46].

3.2. YouTube and Bilingual Young Learners

With the democratisation and demonetisations of technology, most young learners in this 21st Century have access to the device and infrastructure. It allows them to consume social media, including YouTube [24]. This also happens in Indonesia [49]. A study conducted by [19] mentioned students spent their time more than an hour a day on the YouTube platform for entertainment, information seeking, and academic learning. In education, YouTube has been chosen as one of the language learning teaching tools with various types of learning videos and is categorised as a rich source of teaching materials [4], [18]. With YouTube, students can access material that is suitable for learning topics at school and create a fun learning styles to improve their understanding and skills [16], [4]. Sari, Dardjito & Azizah [20] were convinced that using YouTube in the classroom helped their students improve their ability to convey information, time management, working in groups, and technological literacy.

As anyone with a YouTube account can upload their videos to YouTube, various languages are used, depending on the nationality and the choice of language preferred by the content creators. This multilingual exposure can benefit bilingual children who learn new languages [28], [39], [51] either simultaneously or successively [16], [50]. In children learning English as their second language, the videos uploaded in English can be choices for their language exposure. Since young bilingual learners may also face difficulties [22], [29], selections of sources and teaching material that have strong effectiveness can facilitate their learning [26], [42]. In this case, videos from YouTube can be selected to complement the written sources to encourage the students and enriched the classroom [31].

In conclusion, ICT phenomena, especially YouTube, allow students to learn actively and interactively. Learning with YouTube videos is considered one of the most significant changes in the EFL classroom because YouTube is flexible, contained animated videos available to watch that suitable for young bilingual learners [11], [30], [13]. Besides, this study also found the disadvantage of using YouTube as a learning resource for teaching English to young learners, specifically as mentioned by Jones and Cuthrell [5], that accessing YouTube needed a strong internet connection and limited bandwidth. The video quality of YouTube depends on bandwidth or the network load. YouTube advertising reduces effectiveness because it affects learning and prevents student concentration with irrelevant advertising [12].

3.3. YouTube Videos and the Improvement of Young Learners' Vocabulary

Various studies have observed how YouTube can improve young learners' vocabulary in their English learning. A survey conducted by [24] investigated how students' English vocabulary increased through YouTube videos [24]. In this research, four short storytelling videos from YouTube, four minutes long for each video were used. The videos were full captions video, glossed full captions, keyword captions, and glossed keyword captions from six public primary schools in Hong Kong. Full caption video presented keywords that served to identify the meaning with one to four consecutive words. Keyword captions video also came up with a keyword to identify the meaning with a duration of 1.6 seconds, contributing about 20% of the help words to the students. Glossed full captions have a feature that helped students understand sentences in the video by clicking each difficult word with the mouse. Glossed full captions and glossed keyword captions videos can reduce students' mistakes in shooting words and sentences in the video and improve students' understanding of new words. This study showed that the use of animated videos from YouTube helped learners comprehend new words. Similarly, [16] showed that students agreed that YouTube was easy to access, and it was an attractive source for learning vocabulary.

An experimental study carried out by [25] aimed at investigating how watching videos such as vlogs and reading blog posts could support students' second language vocabulary acquisition and whether second language input modalities such as audio-visual versus written text affect aspects of students' vocabulary knowledge. Participants watched three blog videos with an average duration of two to five minutes. The students were assigned to look for six target words, and the most common word classes are three nouns, two verbs, and one adjective, and find ten times the number of target words they find in the video blog to achieve the designed learning. The target words that the student had to find were repeated in each video about three to six times. It was found that text and video can incidentally enhance vocabulary learning. These results were in line with the study from Neuman and Koskinen (1992) as cited in [25], who argued that videos could increase vocabulary building because they were presented with attractive visuals.

Kabooha & Elyas (2018) considered YouTube a useful source to implement in the classroom [16]. This study displayed students' perception of how useful YouTube to help increasing vocabulary skills in reading class. Students were directed to watch a YouTube video with 2 minutes, searched for the messages from the clip and shared their perceptions after watching the video broadcast. Students were given time to discuss with friends and presented the answers that have been made.

This activity helped to encourage students to use new vocabulary that they learned from the video. Presenting information and material in video format moved students' senses compared with the learning tools that only used one sense [16]. This is in line with Wilson as cited in [23] that audio-visual learning resources supported students to understand words better with pictures and actions depicted in videos. The use of YouTube was useful for helping the students memorise English vocabulary, as agreed upon by both the majority of the students and the teachers enrolled in the study.

3.4. YouTube for Listening Comprehension Performance

Mixed research conducted by [27] aimed at inspecting the listening comprehension performance between the experimental and control groups by using video-annotated listening review mechanism (VALRM) from YouTube videos and self-determined listening review mechanism (SDLRM) to 39 students around 13–14 years old. In VALRM, the students listened to the four to five minutes videos and were given two minutes to comprehend the contents in the videos. It aimed at reviewing the effect of the video-annotated listening review mechanism (VALRM) whether VALRM was efficient and effective enough to support the improvement of student skills. After watching the video, the students took a ten-minute listening test to assess their live performance [27]. VALRM from YouTube videos supported students in more effective and efficient listening comprehension training with the text provided by VALRM. VALRM displayed bilingual text that can help students identify unfamiliar English vocabulary and differentiate the words contained in the video. This feature successfully encouraged students' listening skills because it introduced unfamiliar vocabulary to students.

A similar study explored the effect of using YouTube as supplementary material for listening comprehension and analysed students' improvement after 5-week treatments conducted by [17]. Students were given treatment for five weeks, with a 15 questions pre-test in the first week. After the pre-test, students were given learning videos from YouTube. [17] claimed YouTube was able to boost the learning environment and build students' motivation to learn English, particularly in improving students' listening comprehension. [27] also shared the same idea on YouTube videos could interest the students' full attention and made students perform well. The most crucial point was teachers need to keep an eye on choosing the right learning videos and control the proportion of the class activity to create good learning outcomes [17].

Aldukhayel (2019) investigated the use of YouTube vlogs as teaching material in second language learning for teaching listening [21]. The study contained teachers' and students' perceptions on the use of vlogs as effective

teaching material. The vlogs were aired with a computer, a DVD drive, and a data projector. There were four vlogs played twice with English and Arabic captions. In teaching listening, vlog videos were considered a good idea and made significant changes [21]. The use of video blogs presented original visual images, related to real life that can be observed with human senses [21]. This conforms with [10], the use of YouTube had a positive effect on behavioural, emotional, and cognitive involvement. The use of YouTube as a learning source ensured students' engagement, consciousness, and accelerated deep learning [19], [22], [21], [9].

3.5. YouTube and Students' Creativity

Reference [20] explored the effect of YouTube videos on students' creativity during the lesson. The values of YouTube videos can boost students' creativity, interest, motivation, and inspire students to create new things. Various educational videos, such as instructional videos, video tutorials, and animation videos, enabled students to develop individual abilities such as slime making, crafts, painting, and role-playing inspired by watching YouTube. This follows opinion from [35], [36], and [37] that creativity is the capability to consider things from different points of view and surpass the limits of conventional ways of thinking as well as reveal remarkable results. Interactive activities helped students generating interesting ideas in the learning process. This was supported by the statement from [42] and [36] that creativity is formed from new situations and concerns that modify original ideas with something new and unique.

3.6. YouTube Effect on Students' Learning Outcomes, Satisfaction, Self-Improvement

Besides improving the students' vocabulary and listening skills, the use of YouTube videos has also been observed in terms of the effects on students' learning outcome, satisfaction, and self-improvement. A project-based study about using YouTube as a learning instrument for learner-generated content was investigated by [26]. Students participated in the video project creation using YouTube. Students who were active to create videos uploaded on YouTube proven to affect their competence and build a good academic performance. Reference [38] stated that YouTube had positive contributions, especially in subjects they did not understand and students watched videos from YouTube as a substitute for textbooks. This referred to the importance of digital literacy from an early age-related to 21st-century skills [33]. Watching videos activated students' two different senses, seeing and hearing senses, and introduced them to the real things inside the videos [23], [6].

Contents created by the learners have impacts on their learning outcomes and satisfaction. The experience of making YouTube videos increased students' cross-curricular competence, sharpen their technology management skills, and became a forum for their creative ideas that were poured into the process of video making [26], [38]. Reference [20] also added that the use of YouTube in the learning process positively influenced students' behaviour, competence, beliefs, individual tasks for future results, personal awareness of self-identity, and the influence of the surrounding environment. Clifton and Mann's conformity as cited in [19] YouTube guaranteed students' increment in academic activity, critical awareness, and faster learning outcomes.

4. CONCLUSION & LIMITATION

YouTube is considered as a fast, easy, and fun learning and teaching resources in language learning for young learners. Teachers can use videos such as animation, blogger videos, video presentations as teaching resources. The findings in this study reveal that YouTube helps improve students' basic skills such as listening performance, increasing vocabulary, satisfying learning outcomes, and self-improvement. Apart from the many benefits of YouTube in education, YouTube also has limitations that can prevent the learning process. As explained by [33], accessing YouTube requires a stable internet connection because it will affect video viewing quality. Olasina (2017) added that bandwidth, devices for accessing YouTube, and copyright limitations on YouTube can also prevent the learning process [34]. Ads that often appear in the middle of video screenings may also disrupt students' concentration. However, apart from these limitations, this research showed YouTube is the right choice as a learning resource because it provides a significant increase in students' skill levels. As this research concludes that considering choosing YouTube as one of the teaching resources supported by many kinds of research showed promising results on the use of YouTube as a teaching source and learning tool, cautions are needed by teachers and educators to fend off the threat posed by the social media as a profit-oriented platform and its commercial purposes as well as the age-appropriateness of the content for children.

REFERENCES

- [1] M. Ganapathy, S. A.P. Seetharam, The Effects of Using Multimodal Approaches in Meaning-Making of 21st Century Literacy Texts Among ESL Students in a Private School in Malaysia, *Advances in Language and Literary Studies*, 2016, pp. 143-155.
- [2] M. L. Khan, Social media engagement: What motivates user participation and consumption on

- YouTube?, *Computers in Human Behavior*, 2017, pp. 236–247. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chb.2016.09.024>
- [3] J. Balakrishnan, M. D. Griffiths, Social media addiction: What is the role of content in YouTube?, *Journal of Behavioral Addictions*, 6(3), 2017, pp. 364–377. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1556/2006.6.2017.058>
- [4] H. C. Wang, C. W. Chen, Learning English from YouTubers: English L2 learners' self-regulated language learning on YouTube, *Innovation in Language Learning and Teaching*, 14(4), 2019, pp. 333–346. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1080/17501229.2019.1607356>
- [5] T. Jones, K. Cuthrell, YouTube: Educational Potentials and Pitfalls, *Computers in the Schools*, 28(1), 2011, pp. 75–85. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1080/07380569.2011.553149>
- [6] D. DeWitt, N. Alias, S. Siraj, M. Y. Yaakub, J. Ayob, R. Ishak, The Potential of Youtube for Teaching and Learning in the Performing Arts, *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 2013, pp. 1118–1126. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2013.10.439>
- [7] M. J. Z. Abidinn, m. Pour-Mohammadi, K. K. B. Singh, R. Azman, T. Souriyavongsa, The Effectiveness of Using Songs in YouTube to Improve Vocabulary Competence among Upper Secondary School Studies, *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, 2011, 1(11), pp. 1488–1496. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.4304/tpls.1.11.1488-1496>, 2011
- [8] T. C. Hariyono, "Teaching vocabulary to young learner using video on YouTube at English course," *Language Research in Society*, 1(1), 2020, pp. 41–46
- [9] R. M. Tamim, "Teachers' Use of YouTube in the United Arab Emirates: An Exploratory Study," *Computers in the Schools*, 30(4), 2013, pp. 329–345. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1080/07380569.2013.844641>
- [10] S. Roodt, N. Harry, S. Mwapwele, The Effect of Using YouTube in the Classroom for Student Engagement of the Net Generation on an Information Systems Course, Springer International Publishing, 2017, pp. 48–63, DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-69670-6>
- [11] G. Sakkir, S. Dollah, J. Ahmad, Students' Perceptions toward Using YouTube in EFL Classrooms, *Journal of Applied Science, Engineering, Technology, and Education*, 2020, pp. 1–10. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.35877/454ri.asci2125>
- [12] J. Marthinus, D. Sobotker, R. G. Duffet, The Effect of Youtube Advertising on Intention-To Purchase in Terms of Usage Characteristics Amongst Learners at Wester Ford High School, Cape Peninsula University of Technology, 2014.
- [13] I. Nofrika, "EFL Students' Voices: The Role of YouTube in Developing English Competences.," *Journal of Foreign Language Teaching and Learning*, 4(1), 2019, pp. 56–73. <https://doi.org/10.18196/ftl.4138>,
- [14] Alwehaibi, H. Omar, The Impact Of Using YouTube In EFL Classroom On Enhancing EFL Students' Content Learning, *Journal of College Teaching & Learning (TLC)*, 12(2), 2015, pp. 121–126. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.19030/tlc.v12i2.9182> (
- [15] P. Benson, "Commenting to learn: Evidence of language and intercultural learning in comments on YouTube videos," *Language Learning & Technology* 19(3), 2015, pp. 88–105. Retrieved from <http://lt.msu.edu/issues/october2015/benson.pdf>
- [16] R. Kabooha, T. Elyas, The Effects of YouTube in Multimedia Instruction for Vocabulary Learning: Perceptions of EFL Students and Teachers, *English Language Teaching*, 11(2), 2018, pp. 72. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.5539/elt.v11n2p72>
- [17] C. C. Chien, Y. Huang, P. Huang, YouTube Videos on EFL College Students' Listening Comprehension, *English Language Teaching*, 13(6), 2020, pp. 96. <https://doi.org/10.5539/elt.v13n6p96>
- [18] E. M. Dukut, Popularising Indonesian scenes through picturebooks and digital animation software: a World Englishes teaching idea, *Asian Englishes*, 21(2), 2018, pp. 142–157. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1080/13488678.2018.1459071>
- [19] S. Moghavvemi, A. Sulaiman, N. I. Jaafar, N. Kasem, Social media as a complementary learning tool for teaching and learning: The case of youtube, *The International Journal of Management Education*, 16(1), 2018, pp. 37–42. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijme.2017.12.001>
- [20] A. B. P. Sari, H. Dardjito, D. M. Azizah, EFL Students' Improvement through the Reflective YouTube Video Project, *International Journal of Instruction*, 13(4), 2020, pp. 393–408. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.29333/iji.2020.13425a>
- [21] D. Aldukhayel, Vlogs in L2 listening: EFL learners' and teachers' perceptions, *Computer Assisted*

- Language Learning, 2019, pp. 1–20. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09588221.2019.1658608>.
- [22] C. Muñoz, "Exploring young learners' foreign language learning awareness," *Language Awareness*, 23:1-2, 2014, pp. 24-40. DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/09658416.2013.863900>
- [23] C. Oddone, Using Videos from YouTube and Websites in the CLIL Classroom, *Studies About Languages*, 0(18), 2011, pp. 105–110. <https://doi.org/10.5755/j01.sal.0.18.417>
- [24] M. F. Teng, Vocabulary learning through videos: captions, advance-organiser strategy, and their combination, *Computer Assisted Language Learning*, 2020, pp. 1–33. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09588221.2020.1720253>
- [25] H. Arndt, Vocabulary learning from watching YouTube videos and reading blog posts, *Language Learning & Technology*, 2018, pp. 124–142
- [26] C. Orús, M. J. Barles, D. Belanjce, L. Casalo, E. Fraj, R. Guerra, The Use Of Youtube As A Tool For Learner-Generated Content: Effects On Students' Learning Outcomes And Satisfaction, *Computers & Education*, 2016, pp. doi: 10.1016/j.compedu.2016.01.007
- [27] C. M. Chen, I. C. Chen, The effects of video-annotated listening review mechanism on promoting EFL listening comprehension, *Interactive Learning Environments*, 2019, pp. 1–15. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1080/10494820.2019.1579232>
- [28] C. Myers-Scotton, *Multiple Voices: An Introduction to Bilingualism*, Blackwell Publishing Ltd, Oxford, 2006.
- [29] F. Copland, E. Yonetsugi, Teaching English to Young Learners: Supporting the Case for the Bilingual Native English Speaker Teacher, *Classroom Discourse*, 7(3), 2016, pp. 221–238. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1080/19463014.2016.1192050>
- [30] A. Y. Kim, A. Park, B. Lust, Simultaneous vs. successive bilingualism among preschool-aged children: a study of four-year-old Korean–English bilinguals in the USA, *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 21(2), 2016, pp. 164–178. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1080/13670050.2016.1145186>
- [31] S. Tolu O. V. Yurdakul, B. Basaran, A. Rezvani, English-language videos on YouTube as a source of information on self-administer subcutaneous anti-tumour necrosis factor agent injections, *Rheumatology International*, 38(7), 2018, pp. 1285–1292. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00296-018-4047-8>
- [32] S. M. C. Lau, Intercultural education through a bilingual children's rights project: reflections on its possibilities and challenges with young learners, *Intercultural Education*, 26(6), 2015, pp. 469–482. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1080/14675986.2015.1109774>
- [33] Q. Zhou, C. S. Lee, S. C. J. Sin, S. Lin, H. Hu, M. F. F. B. Ismail, Understanding the use of YouTube as a learning resource: a social cognitive perspective, *Aslib Journal of Information Management*, 72(3), 2020, pp. 339–359. DOI: 10.1108/ajim-10-2019-0290
- [34] J. E. Fox, R. Schirmacher, *Art and Creative Development for Young Children*, Translated and edited by N. Aral and G. Duman: Ankara: Nobel Publications., 2014.
- [35] A. Ata-Akturk, S. Sevimli-Celik, Creativity in early childhood teacher education: beliefs and practices, *International Journal of Early Years Education*, 2020, pp. 1–20. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1080/09669760.2020.1754174>
- [36] A. Ata-Akturk, S. Sevimli-Celik, Creativity in early childhood teacher education: beliefs and practices, *International Journal of Early Years Education*, 2020, pp. 1–20. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1080/09669760.2020.1754174>
- [37] N. Jabar, A. M. Ali, Cultural Video Project Assignment (VPA) through the Eyes of Young ESL Learners: A Multi-Modal Vocabulary Learning Approach, *Indonesian Journal of EFL and Linguistics*, 1(2), 2016, pp. 157–173. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.21462/ijefll.v1i2.11>
- [38] S. A. Azer, R. A. Bokhari, G. S. AlSaleh, M. M. Alabdulaaly, K. I. Ateeq, A. P. S. Guerrero, S. Azer, Experience of parents of children with autism on YouTube: are there educationally useful videos?, *Informatics for Health and Social Care*, 43(3), 2018, pp. 219–233. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1080/17538157.2018.1431238>
- [39] A. Cho, YouTube and Academic Libraries: Building a Digital Collection, *Journal of Electronic Resources Librarianship*, 25(1), 2013, pp. 39–50. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1080/1941126x.2013.761521>
- [40] R. Ferguson, D. Faulkner, D. Whitelock, K. Sheehy, "Pre-teens' informal learning with ICT and Web 2.0," *Technology, Pedagogy and Education*, 24(2), 2014, pp. 247–265. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1080/1475939x.2013.870596>
- [41] P. Haworth, J. Cullen, H. Simmons, L. Schimanski, P. McGarva, E. Woodhead, *The Role of Acquisition*

- and Learning In Young Children's Bilingual Development: A Sociocultural Interpretation, *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 9(3), 2006, pp. 295–309. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1080/13670050608668651>
- [42] S. Auttawutikul, K. Wiwitkunkasem, D. R. Smith, Use of weblogs to enhance group learning and design creativity amongst students at a Thai University, *Innovations in Education and Teaching International*, 51(4), 2014, pp. 378–388. DOI: [doi:10.1080/14703297.2013.796723](https://doi.org/10.1080/14703297.2013.796723)
- [43] B. Trilling, C. Fadel, *21st century skills: learning for life in our times*, Jossey-Bass, 2009.
- [44] P. H. & K. S. Diamandis, *Abundance: The Future Is Better Than You Think*, Free Press, New York, 2012.
- [45] M. Strangelove, *Watching YouTube: Extraordinary Videos by Ordinary People*, University of Toronto Press, 2010
- [46] B. Miller, *YouTube as Educator: A Content Analysis of Issues, Themes, and the Educational Value of Transgender-Created Online Videos*, *Social Media + Society*, 2017, pp. 1–12. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1177%2F2056305117716271>
- [47] H. Aveyard, *Doing a Literature Review in Health and Social Care: A practical guide Second edition*, Open University Press, 2010.
- [48] M. W. George, *The Elements of Library Research*, Princeton University Press, 2008.
- [49] APJII, *Penetrasi & Profil Perilaku Pengguna Internet Indonesia*, In *Asosiasi Penyelenggara Jasa Internet Indonesia*. 2019, Retrieved from www.apjii.or.id
- [50] N. L. P. S. Adnyani, N. L. S. Beratha, I. N. Suparwa, Child Comprehension of Adults' Verbal Input: A Case of Bilingual Acquisition in Infancy, *Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 7(1), 2017, pp. 11-18. DOI: [dx.doi.org/10.17509/ijal.v7i1.6853](https://doi.org/10.17509/ijal.v7i1.6853)
- [51] N. L. P. S. Adnyani, N. L. S. Beratha, I. W. Pastika, I. N. Suparwa, The development of verbal morphology and word order in an Indonesian-German bilingual child: A case study, *Topics in Linguistics*, 19(1), 2018, pp. 33-53.