

Which One is the Most Effective: Authentic Audiovisual Material, Inauthentic Audiovisual Material, or Ordinary Audio Material?

Augustina Widiasih
Applied Linguistics Study Program
Graduate School, Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta
Yogyakarta, Indonesia
augustinaawidiasih@gmail.com

Pratomo Widodo
Applied Linguistics Study Program
Graduate School, Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta
Yogyakarta, Indonesia
prat_wid@yahoo.com

Abstract—This research aims at investigating: (1) the most effective listening material that we can use to enhance students' listening comprehension, and (2) the level of significance of the difference on the students' listening comprehension among the classes given treatments. This is a quasi-experimental study making use of a pretest-posttest, non-equivalent control group design. Taken from the population of all Ahmad Dahlan University students sitting in the second semester, cluster random sampling technique was used to determine the sample groups. Treatments using authentic and inauthentic audiovisual material were given to the experimental group 1 and 2, while the ordinary audio material was given to the control group. Descriptive and inferential statistics techniques were applied to analyze the data gathered. Conclusion drawn from the results of data analysis is: (1) most effective listening material that we can use to enhance students' listening comprehension is authentic audiovisual material, and (2) there is a significant difference on the students' listening comprehension between the classes taught using authentic and inauthentic audiovisual material and the other taught using ordinary audio material.

Keywords—*listening comprehension; ordinary audio material; inauthentic audiovisual material; authentic audiovisual material.*

I. INTRODUCTION

Listening is an activity that everyone naturally experiences. Even before birth, this activity has existed. Listening process has already taken place in the womb of a mother, while a baby is still growing inside of it. From his mother's womb, a baby can hear his mommy's voice and any other voices or sounds around. Before he can do other language skills like speaking, reading, or writing, he can do listening. Long before he knows what so called a language, what and how to do with it, he has experienced listening. We begin communicating and learning a language through listening. Listening was the primary channel by which the learner gains access to L2 'data', and that it therefore serves as the trigger for acquisition [1]. It has been viewed as the primary vehicle for language learning.

Teachers and scholars have recognized much more the significance of the teaching of listening in the EFL classroom for their understanding of the uniqueness and

meaningfulness of listening skill towards communication and language learning has improved [2]. For improving the teaching and learning process of listening, studies, researches, and trainings are conducted to find out more of what to do. One which is regarded the top essential is to enable language learners have the best opportunity to learn and possess appropriate language competence. Effective teachers would be those who are able to be active and creative in meeting the students' needs. They must be capable of evaluating, adapting, and creating good materials to meet those different needs [3].

Obstacles that come across and need to be faced by learners during the learning process have made it more important for teachers and researchers to pay more attention to listening. As a foreign language which is learned or acquired after the local language and Bahasa as the national language, English takes more and more effort of the learners to either understand or produce well. In listening, problems might emerge for the distinct phonological and stress systems of the language. These distinctions might cause problems to the students' listening comprehension which later can generate problem to the students' low competence of the listening skill. Reid in Pokrivčáková has suggested cautious materials selection concerning the age of the students', level of language, language background, usefulness and interests of the learners as a solution to decrease such problems as students' unconfidence and difficulties [4]. As one in charge of the classroom management, teachers must be able to be wise in choosing the appropriate, if not the best fit, materials, media, method, techniques or strategies which can help smoothen the process of teaching and learning of English as a foreign language so that such a problem can be reduced.

Bringing in and using authentic materials can be one of the ways of providing pleasant materials for the teaching and learning process in the classroom. Authentic supporting materials can create enjoyable learning that motivates the students to learn more. Moreover, by using materials which are authentic, the students will get the opportunity to get introduced to the real target language daily life use. Making use of these kind of materials also enables us to reduce the gap exists between the language used in and out side the classroom. Often, conversation provided in the textbooks as

the source of learning material does not really describe the real model of the native speakers language use in real life. Therefore, the listening practices of the students does not represent the natural or real daily life conversation which contains natural features of spoken language.

Despite the advantages that authentic materials have, there are also some drawbacks this materials may have that teachers should be aware and alert of. Unlike the instructional materials which are usually set based on the learning objectives, these authentic materials, as they are picked unmodified or unadjusted from the resources, may have difficult vocabulary and complex structures that low level language learners would possibly find obstacles in understanding or interpreting. It is also strongly argued by teachers as well as scholars that instructional materials are effective in the way that they are intendedly designed to meet the teaching and learning objectives, and therefore suitable for the learners. Thus, a debate arguing which materials are most effective to be used in listening class, has risen.

Regarding the importance of language as a means of communication that can improve one's information or knowledge – by which he can improve the quality of his life, and that classroom learning enables us to learn and master languages, and listening is base to language learning, so as to the fact that authentic materials are found both good and inadequate at the same time, also regarding the gap between the language used in and outside the class, the author works on this study, that is, trying to find the answer of which materials are most effective to be used in the listening class.

II. RELATED LITERATURE REVIEW

A. *Listening*

We can use listening, by its' complex process, to understand the message conveyed in spoken language. It enables us to follow what someone is willing to express or inform by his utterances. It enables us to recognise what he intends to do by his message. We will be able to recognise whether he only informs something or wants a reply or respond. He gave an addition that listening, more than just one of the language skills performed, is also an essential method to acquire a second or foreign language.

Brown [5] in his book questioned about the possibility of speaking without listening. It confirmed the significance of listening that someone's oral production competence is in line with his listening comprehension competence. Listening plays a principal role in the learning process as it serves as the input for the students. Only by getting the input right at the level, the process of learning can start. It is the first stage in learning spoken language.

B. *Audiovisual Media*

There are numerous media and many styles of visual presentation beneficial for language learners. This statement confirms that all audio-visual materials have great contributions to language learning as long as they are used at the right time, in the right place. River claims that it obviously

contributes to the apprehending of other cultures by providing vicarious contact with speakers of the language, through both audio and visual means [6].

Field stated that facial expressions and visual cues help us comprehend conversations. Wagner added, the advantages of having audiovisual materials in the classroom is very certain as most real life communication carries face to face contact which enables the listener to see his companion – the speaker – and therefore this material gives richer input for language learners than that of audio-only one [7]. Pollack in Ghani's book proposed that listeners are abundantly assisted by the movements of the speaker's mouth so that they have more possibility to understand what he intends to say even in an environment with noise or crowd [8].

C. *Authentic Material*

The writer refers to authentic material as one brought to classroom teaching and learning process, originally produced not only in spoken but also in written form of language as a mother tongue of the speaker for communication, sharing or gaining knowledge, and or other non-instructional purposes.

Little, David and Singleton defined authentic material as one made to attain certain social purposes in the society – that is, materials which are not intendedly designed for language learning purposes.

One of the advantages this material can give is the abundance of rich and true value of the target language learned [9]. Learners therefore have the opportunity to get and learn the real samples of real life use of the language. Supporting the idea, using authentic materials in the classroom can give bigger opportunity to the learners to be exposed to more real language. They cover various qualified sources of extensive listening materials, too [10]. Authentic material will help language learners find listening better and easier. Kumaravadevelu [11] added that authentic material can also motivate students to learn more independently by trying to search for materials appropriate for their level from the internet or other possible resources.

Gilmore [12] said that unadjusted authentic materials are good in the sense that they can enrich the learners' English. The richness of grammatical rules and language features exposed in the materials will arouse them to keep gaining new knowledge of the language. Furthermore, he added that exposure will motivate learners to learn new things. Being familiar with the complications that a language have, their language competence will surely be able to naturally enriched.

Furthermore, considering that listening has an important role for communication as well as educational process, Krashen – in his input hypothesis, argued that being in an environment in which natural exposure to the target language is rich will support the language acquisition that initiate learners to learn effortlessly.

D. *Inauthentic Materials*

Inauthentic materials are materials used in the teaching and learning process designed intendedly for teaching purposes. Peacock's [13] noted that these materials are

produced specifically to meet language learners need. In conclusion, inauthentic materials means teaching or instructional materials.

Inauthentic materials are regarded more suitable for language learners, especially to those who belong to the beginner level. This kind of materials like textbooks are prepared and made regarding the learners' language level and competence so that it enables the learners to learn better and easier.

Even so, arranged and organized by teachers for learning purposes, these inauthentic materials then tend to be far from natural. They are considered as having poor natural exposure to the real daily life use of the target language. An obvious distinction can be figured out between the language used in and outside the classroom. Samples of conversations seem uncessessful to function as the real model of language employed by native speakers daily life conversation. Further, foreign language learners are often found unable to speak appropriate English naturally for communication outside the class though they have studied English quite a lot for years inside the class.

E. Ordinary Audio Material

The author refers to ordinary audio as pedagogical audio material, that is, audio material designed for the purpose of pedagogy. Pedagogy is defined as both the art and science of teaching, a master-plan including a complete analysis of what a teacher h to do in the teaching and learning process in the classromm [14]. In continental Europe, 'pedagogy' specifically points to not only classroom teaching practice and techniques; but also to the theories of children and learning that give basic structure for practices. It shows teaching and learning dependant relation, and treats teaching as an activity that can be considered unified from the understanding of how learners learn. It is a teaching and learning theory including aims, content of curriculum and teaching methodology [15].

Technology have had an important role since the United States history of language teaching. In the twentieth century, due to a new approach, various electronic devices had been used in a foreign or second language classroom to make the learners follow the language learning process easier. It could clearly be seen that the use of audio media to support language learning process began to improve. Johnston [16] defined audio as the aural material electronic transmission, in both live and recorded forms. It was used in purpose of developing the aural-oral skills of language learners.

Listening audio materials can be defined as dialogues and monologues of the native speakers which are recorded intededly for the classroom learning process. English teachers have ideals to teach students languages, such as pronunciation and intonation, as they are conveyed by the native speakers [17].

Those definitions about audio material above have led the author to come to a conclusion that audio material is material designed and applied for listening classes by utilizing audio media. Sharing the same idea, Graham & Santos proposed that pedagogical audio material is audio material

organised and used for the purposes of pedagogy [18]. To conclude, ordinary audio materials are materials designed and used for the teaching and learning process of listening in the classroom by utilizing audio media.

III. RESEARCH METHODS

This study applied quasi-experimental research using pretest-posttest, non-equivalent control group design. Taken from the population of all Ahmad Dahlan University students sitting in the second semester, cluster random sampling technique was used to determine the sample groups. Treatments using authentic audiovisual material were given to the experimental group 1. While treatments using inauthentic audiovisual material were given to the experimental group 2. The control group was given treatments using ordinary audio material. Listening pretest and posttest with multiple choice items were used as instrument to collect the data. This instrument was proven valid and reliable through validity and reliability tests administered before it was used in the data collecting period. The data collected were then analyzed using descriptive and inferential statistics techniques.

IV. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

A. Descriptive Test Result

The results of pretest-posttest are described in the following tables.

TABLE I. THE DESCRIPTIVE STATISTICS OF THE PRETEST AND POSTTEST SCORE

Group	Authentic Audiovisual		Inauthentic Audiovisual		Ordinary Audio	
	Pre test	Post test	Pre test	Post test	Pre test	Post test
N	22	22	20	20	19	19
Mean	52.48	69.29	57.00	68.75	54.50	59.08
Std.Dev.	13.39	7.80	10.28	9.68	16.13	14.41
Min.	11.50	57.50	38.00	50.00	25.00	30.00
Max.	71.00	85.00	75.00	87.50	77.50	80.00

TABLE II. THE RISE OF SCORE FROM PRETEST TO POSTTEST

Group	Authentic Audiovisual	Inauthentic Audiovisual	Ordinary Audio
Rise of Score	16,8	11,7	4,6

The tables inform the distinc results from the pre and and posttest taken. The rise of the mean score of the authentic audiovisual group was about 16,8 points, the inauthentic audiovisual group was increasing about 11,7 points, while the control group was improving about 4,6 points.

Regarding the pretest and posttest listening comprehension score classification among the experiment groups (authentic and inauthentic audiovisual) and control

group (ordinary audio), a conclusion can be derived. Compared to the other two materials, authentic audiovisual material was the most effective materials to use in listening class. It is in line with Little, David and Singleton's opinion that bringing in authentic materials to the classroom would create enjoyable learning that motivates the students to learn more [19]. A comfortable atmosphere such as enjoyable, exciting, and motivating in the classroom will surely increase the students' motivation to learning thus may increase their target language competence. Trabelsi added that authentic materials are found more suitable for higher level students like university. The rich variety of materials of diverse topics or interests will give them plenty of exposure to the target language employed by native speakers of different languages learned.

B. Hypothesis Test Result

As the Levene's (homogeneity) test result showed that the variances were not homogeneous, parametric test can not be applied for the hypothesis test. Nonparametric test namely Kruskal-Wallis test was therefore taken for the hypothesis test.

The following table depicts the hypothesis testing statistics of the research.

TABLE III. KRUSKAL-WALLIS' TEST STATISTICS A,B

	Pretest Score	Posttest Score
Chi-Square	0.887	6.636
df	2	2
Asymp. Sig.	0.642	0.036

a. Kruskal Wallis Test

b. Grouping Variable: Listening Material

The data in the table depicted that the F of pretest score was 0.887 and the posttest score was 6.636 with the significance of probability 0.036. As the score of probability was proven lower than 0.05 ($0.036 < 0.050$), H_0 was found rejected and H_a was therefore accepted. It can be concluded that there was a significant difference on the students' listening comprehension between the classes taught using authentic and inauthentic audiovisual materials and the other one using ordinary audio material.

The hypothesis test result prove that authentic audiovisual material was the most effective material to enhance students' listening comprehension. This confirmed and strengthened previous researches or study conducted by other teachers or scholars showing the same conclusion that materials which are authentic was proven effective to be applied in the listening classroom. It had also proven the theory proposed by Little, Davitt and Singleton that bringing in authentic materials to the classroom can create more exciting learning atmosphere and the students, therefore, can be more motivated to learn. As the students feel more motivated, their classroom participation towards the learning activities would arise, too. A class with good learning

atmosphere within will make the students feel comfortable to learn in, and then will give positive effect as improvement in the students' competency of English as the target language. This has also proven the proposed idea that video media have lots of benefits as they enable language learners to forcefully gain new knowledge because they are positively supportive, culturally rich in language features and of course, authentic. By using authentic materials, students have the chance to be able to get in touch with more samples of real daily language used in real life communication. Sharing the same opinion, Berardo said that this kind of materials have positive contribution to the process of language learning as they represent the factual language use, and support learners to actively participated in the learning process they have in the classroom.

This originally taken from the resources materials are good for learners, especially the higher level ones, to enhance their mastery of English. They can gain more and more knowledge from the richness of grammatical rules as well as language features provided in the materials. Being touched to these materials, language learners can learn new things better and more. Being touched by and familiar with the complication of language features, their language proficiency will be enriched.

V. CONCLUSIONS AND IMPLICATIONS

Based on the result of the descriptive statistics, the highest improvement of mean score was shown from the group given authentic audiovisual material for treatments. In other words, to enhance students' listening comprehension, authentic audiovisual material is the most effective material to be used in listening class. While the result of hypothesis test showed the significant difference on the students' listening comprehension between the classes taught using authentic and inauthentic audiovisual materials and the other one taught using ordinary audio material.

These research findings would hopefully motivate English teachers to search for, gather, and then use both or either authentic and or inauthentic audiovisual materials provided in the internet or any other possible resources to create a more engaging and motivating listening class or course. Students are highly recommended to take advantage of those materials for enriching their listening comprehension. Abundance of resources are provided for them to learn or practise listening independently. Million videos of diverse subject matters uploaded in the internet are set to help them have better competency of English. Principals, chief of departments or divisions, and other education stakeholders should support their teachers to bring in these rich materials into the listening classes so that the teaching and learning process would be more effective and fun at the same time.

REFERENCES

- [1] Rost, Michael.(1994). "Introducing Listening". London: Penguin.
- [2] Rubin, Joan. (1994). "A Review of Second Language Listening Comprehension Research." *The Modern Language Journal*, 78, ii.USA: the University of Wisconsin Press.
- [3] Tomlinson Tomlinson, B. (2001). *Materials Development in Carter, R. & Nunan, D., The Cambridge guide to teaching English to speakers of other languages* (pp. 66-71). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- [4] Pokrivcakova, S. (2009). *Modern Teacher of English*. Nitra: ASPA.
- [5] Brown, H.D. (2001). " by principles: An interactive approach to language pedagogy". London: Addison Wesley Longman, Inc.
- [6] Cakir, Ismail. (2006). "The Use of Video as an Audio-Visual Material in Foreign Language Teaching Classroom." *The Turkish Online Journal of Educational Technology – TOJET* October 2006 Volume 5 Issue 4 Article 9. Retrieved from www.researchgate.net.
- [7] Wagner, Elvis. (2010). "The Effect of the Use of Video Texts on ESL" Listening Test-Taker Performance. Article in *Language Testing* 27(2) · October 2010 retrieved from <https://www.researchgate.net>.
- [8] Ghani, M.K.B.A. (2012)." Using Authentic Audio-Visual Materials in English Language Listening Test." Faculty of Education Universiti Teknologi Malaysia.
- [9] Carter, R. and Nunan, D. (2001). *The Cambridge guide to teaching English to speakers of other languages*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- [10] Harmer, J. (2007). *The practice of English language teaching*. London: Pearson Education Limited.
- [11] Kumaravadivelu, Bala. (2006). "Understanding Language Teaching, from Method to Post Method." Article. Retrieved from <https://www.researchgate.net/publication>
- [12] Febrina, W. (2017). Authentic vs non-authentic materials in teaching English as a Foreign Language (EFL) in Indonesia: Which one matters more? *Proceeding of The Asian Conference on Education 2017*. Australia.
- [13] Peacock, M. (1997). The effect of authentic materials on the motivation of EFL learners. *ELT Journal*. 51(2). 144-156. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- [14] Bhowmik, M., Banerjee, B. & Banerjee J. (2013). Role of pedagogy in effective teaching. *Basic Research Journal of Education Research*. 2(1). 01-05. ISSN 2315-6872. Retrieved from <http://www.basicresearchjournals.org>
- [15] Husbands, C. & Pearce, J. (2012). What makes great pedagogy? Nine claims from research. *National College for School Leadership*. Nottingham. Retrieved from <https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk>
- [16] Johnson, K. (2001). *An introduction to foreign language learning and teaching –second edition*. London: Pearson Education Limited – Longman.
- [17] Kaur, P., & Raman, A. (2014). Exploring native speaker and non-native speaker accents: The English as a lingua franca perspective. *Procedia – Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 155, 253-259.
- [18] Graham, S. & Santos, D. (2015). *Strategies for second language listening: Current scenarios & improved pedagogy*. London: Palgrave Macmillan.
- [19] Little, D., Devitt, Singleton, D.(1989). *Authentic Texts in Foreign Language Teaching: Theory and Practice*. Dublin: Authentic Language Learning Resources.