

Village Government Leadership Towards Optimizing Society Participation in Development Planning

Adam Latif
Dept. of Government
Muhammadiyah Sidenreng Rappang
University
Rappang, Indonesia
adamlatifsaja2017@gmail.com

Irwan
Dept. of Government
Muhammadiyah Sidenreng Rappang
University
Rappang, Indonesia
irwanirwan41083@gmail.com

Ahmad Mustanir
Dept. of Government
Muhammadiyah Sidenreng Rappang
University
Rappang, Indonesia
ahmadmustanir74@gmail.com

Jamaluddin Ahmad
Dept. of Public Administration
Muhammadiyah Sidenreng Rappang University
Rappang, Indonesia
jahmadlado@yahoo.co.id

Geminastiti Sakkir
English Education Department
Universitas Negeri Makassar
Makassar, Indonesia
hj.geminastitisakkir@yahoo.com

Abstract: This research is to find out the leadership of the village government and to find out society participation in development planning in Pattondon Salu Village, Maiwa District, Enrekang Regency. The hypothesis of this study is that village government leadership has a significant effect on optimizing society participation in development planning. The location of this research in Pattondon Salu Village, Maiwa District, Enrekang Regency. The population in this study is 133 Families (KK). The sampling technique uses incidental sampling with the Slovin formula. The sample in this study is 100 Families (KK). The techniques of collecting data use observation, questionnaires, documentation, and interviews. Quantitative data analysis techniques using frequency tabulation analysis methods and simple regression analysis using the SPSS 16.0 for Windows program. This results shows that, 1) Village government leadership is categorized in the good criteria with an average percentage of 63.95%, 2) Society participation in development planning categorized as a fairly good with an average percentage of 58.95%. In addition, there is a strong influence between village government leadership and the optimization of society participation in development planning.

Keywords— *Development Planning; Leadership; Society Participation*

I. INTRODUCTION

The village government 's leadership was necessary in the optimalization of the participation of society where the village government's are able to influence the society to reach the purpose of the goal that has been fixed by different activities which would be carried out and together. The god leadership is a leadership consider important the achieved of the goal of the group is likely to have taken place of all members, the power and all of the responsibilities of the members. That why the main significance of the good leadership style is the distribusian of authority and responsibility of the leader of a number of members, without having the loss of participation and responsibilities against the group overall.

The success and failure of the village's development is heavily influenced by the leadership of a village government

of how much it planned, do, motivate, give directions, communicated, the execution in influence the people to participate in construction of the village.

Based on the previous observation in the Pattondon Salu village, Maiwa sub-district of Enrekang regemcy, the researchers found some problems as follows:

1. Society participation only in implementation and just accept the result, where in construction planning process not include all the village society, so the construction on the time was not yet proper target and spread evenly for all villages.
2. The lack of public involvement in the development program evaluation has made the lack of progress or data renewal.
3. The village government in practice the instruction function and participation as the leader still not have to take place effectively.
4. The leader of the village's government in doing of duty and function has not yet effective in the arranged, controlled and involved the activities of society.

A. *The Concept of Leadership*

Leadership is how the process the people to be a leader or how be born to be the leader [1] [2] [3]. [5]; [6]; [7] stated that the indicators of leadership as follow:

- Be fair
In the activities of the organization, the togetherness meaning of the members are the absolute, because the togetherness is the representative of the deal between the leaders and the members to get the organization 's purpose.
- Gives suggestion
The suggestion are generally referred to as advice or our recommendation. Suggestion is a influence and so on, that able to move another person 's life and suggestion has a very important role in the mantain and develop the prices of self-determination, participation, and the togetherness.

- Support the purpose
The purpose of the organization not automatically done, it should be supported by the leadership. Therefore, in order to any organization can be effective in the sense of capable of reaching the purpose, it has any one desire to achieve to be taken to be appropriate to the state of the organization as well as to allow the subordinate to the work together.
- Catalyst
A leader is said to have a role as catalyst, if the leader was always to improve all human resources, attempting to provide a response to the rapid response to a maximum work.
- Creating a sense of safe
Every leader is must practiced the sense of safe for his members. This can only be implemented if any leader was able to sustain the positive things, the optimistic attitude in the face of all issues, so making it all in the right way.
- Representative of the organization
Every members that work in all organization units, always look in on their leader have the big role in every activities, especially about the goog model. A leader is everything, therefore all of his words, acts and habits always give impression.
- The source of inspiration
Each a leader must always raise the spirit of the group member, so the group member can perceive and understand the purpose of organization with an enthusiastic and work effectively to get the goals of oranization.
- Respect each other
Every group member in organization need the confession and reward from the leader. Therefore, it is a duty of the leader to give award or recognition to any position to his subordinates.

B. Village's Government

Village's government was a activities in order of the impementation government to be held by the village's government that consists the head of villages and its components [8]; [9]. Solekhan (2014: 16) said that the village's government is a unit of government that the most adjacent to society, the position and the rank of the law always been a debate primarily on the political elite.

C. Society's Participation

Totok in [11]; [12]; [13]; [14]; [15] said that society's participation is the participate of society in the process of defining the problems and issues that exists in society, the choice and the taking decision of an alternative solution to the priority of the problems, the execution of an attempt to overcome the problems, and the ecollapse of the society in the evaluation process of alteration that occurs. The people 's participation is emphasize on "participation" directly of society in the taking decision on institution and and the process of administration. Adisasmita in Solekhan (2014: 141) and [17]; [18]; [19] suggested that the society is ecollapsed at the emoriant and a member of the community in the embuilding, covering activities in the development of

planning and implementation that work by the local people (society).

The indicators of this research [21]; [22]; [23]; [24] stated that society participation divided into four types, which is:

- Participation in problem identification
The participation of a community in identifiable these problems is primarily related by determining an alternative to a community to approach the word agreed about a wide variety of ideas which concern joint interests. Participation in the case of identifying this problem is very important, as the community demanded that they determined the issue, the way and development orientation.
- Participation in taking decision
The society participation of taking the public 's decision deals with an alternate determining with the people to get the deals with all the members interests. Participating in this decision was crucial, because the society demanded to participate the direction and orientation of the development. The presence of society participation in decision is varied, such as meetings presence, discussion, donation of thinking, responses or repudiation to the program offered.
- Participation in implementation
The society participation in implementation of the program is scheduled from the previous planning, which are both related to planning, ways, and purposes. In the implementation of the program, it is very much needed involvement of many elements, in particular the government in its position as a major source of construction.
- Participating in the evaluation
Participation of the society in the evaluation related with the problem of implementation the program comprehensively. It aims to know whether the program is in accordance with a plan set or there is deviations.

D. Planning Construction Concepts

Planning construction of the village was a type or model of searches of the potential and the idea of the development of the village that emphasize of participation of society in the entire process of construction [25]; [26]; [27]; [28]; [29]; [30]; [31]; [32]. This concept was altered by values and spirit "Gotong Royong" (Community self-help/ mutual cooperation) which has going deep into Indonesian culture. "Gotong Royong" rests on a belief that every citizens have the right to decide and plan what is best for themself and environment as well as the best ways create it.

On the outline of the village planning contains the following defintions:

- planning as a series of analysis activity started from indentification of society needs till to establish on the development program.
- Environmental development planning; All programmes of the upgrading prosperity, peaceful, prosperity and peaceful of society in the environment from the small unit till the village level.
- Develoment planning was established on issues, the needs, aspiration, and resources of the place.

- Village planning has been formed to be real roles of society in built the future.
- Planning that produce development program that hoped to provide the impact on the increasing prosperity and peace.

II. RESEARCH METHODS

This research located in the Pattondon Salu 's village, Maiwa sub-district, Enrekang regency. The research used quantitative data and descriptive quantitative research design because this research would describe the facts and describe the state of the research object based on the facts along with and try to investigate. It is based on the data based on the field of government 's leadership and the optimization of people 's participation in the development of planning [33]. The population in this research is 133 of the family/ "Kepala Keluarga" (KK). Sample sampling techniques use *Insidental Sampling* with using the Slovin formula. Sample of this rsearch is 100 family/ KK. Data collection techniques use observation, questionnaires, documentation, and interviews. Quantitative data analysis techniques use the conforming tabulation method and simple regresing analysis using the SPSS 16.0 for windows program.

III. FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS

A. The Analysis of the Tabulation Frequency

The analysis of the tabulation frequencies are interpreted the average rate of each variable of the research to provide a representation on the indicators that built the research model concept with comprehensive. Representation of analysis of the tabulation frequencies on the variable recapitulation are the following:

TABLE. 1 RECAPITULATION OF THE RESPONSES REACTION ABOUT THE LEADERSHIP OF VILLAGE GOVERNMENT.

No.	Leadership	Percentage (%)
1.	Be fair	54,8
2.	Give suggestion	58,2
3.	Support the purpose	54,6
4.	Catalyst	67
5.	Safety	71,4
6.	Representative of organization	63,6
7.	Source of inspiration	70
8.	Respect each other	72
Total		511,6
Average score = $\frac{511,6}{8} = 63,95 \%$		

Source: The analysis of the 2019 questionnaire.

Table. 1 showed that the participants respond about the leadership of Pattondon Salu’s village, Maiwa sub-district, Enrekang regency. From the eighth qualifications among other being fair, gives suggestion, supporting the purpose, catalyst, creating a sense of safe, as a representative of the

organization, the source of inspiration, and respect each other obtained the average score was 63,95% which included as good category.

To amplifying this findings as are criticised above, the author conducted the data oversharing through an interview with the head of prosperity section of the Pattondon Salu 's village, Maiwa sub-district, Enrekang regency (Muh. Syafyuddin), he says that:

"The head of the village as the leader should be more educated and quickly in face of any situation, moreover in give services to society. According to me, there is a little changes done in the administration of services to the society to be more effective and efficient".

Based the research results of the society participation in Pattondon Salu’s village, Maiwa sub-district, Enrekang regency, then to find the participation levels of society can be seen in the following recapitulation table:

TABLE. 2 RECAPITULATION OF PARTICIPANTS RESPOND ABOUT SOCIETY PARTICIPATION

No.	Society Participation	Percentage (%)
1.	Partisipation in Problem Identification	55,2
2.	Partisipation in taking Decision	58,6
3.	Partisipation in Implementation	56
4.	Partisipation in Evaluation	66
Total		235,8
Average score = $\frac{235,8}{4} = 58,95 \%$		

Source: the analysis of the 2019 questionnaire

Table. 2 describes the response of participants about society participation in Pattondon Salu’s village, Maiwa sub-district, Enrekang regency. From the four types, the average of the score was 58,95% which included a good category.

To strengthened this statement in such as durning on the previous, the researcher conducted a data through interview with the head of prosperity section of Pattondon Salu 's village, Maiwa sub-district, Enrekang regency (Muh. Syafyuddin), he said that:

"Society participation in Pattondon Salu village still low and plan to the future more than increase the society participation, so that the process of development village would be more maksimum".

Based on the results of recapitulations and interviews with the head of the prosperity section of the Pattondon Salu's village, Maiwa sub-district, Enrekang Regency (Muh. Syafyuddin), so the author concluded that society participation in the Pattondon Salu’s village, Maiwa sub-district, Enrekang regency is either good.

B. The Test Data Quality

1) Validation Test

Validation test in this research using corrected item- total correlation to determine whether an item is valid or not, so the experts define the coefficient of total item correlation is

0,25 or 0,30 which can be seen from the result of data analysis with SPSS program 16.0 version.

TABLE. 3 RESULT OF VALIDITY OF X VARIABLE (LEADERSHIP) ITEM-TOTAL STATISTICS

	Scale Mean if Item Deleted	Scale Variance if Item Deleted	Corrected Item-Total Correlation	Cronbach's Alpha if Item Deleted
X1	23.24	13.255	.727	.754
X2	23.07	14.692	.572	.780
X3	23.25	13.866	.609	.774
X4	22.63	15.872	.415	.802
X5	22.41	12.002	.838	.729
X6	22.40	16.929	.435	.802
X7	22.48	15.585	.283	.832
X8	22.38	17.026	.414	.804

Sources: data analysis of results research in 2019

Based on the result of test validity analysis above, it is known that 8 items (leadership indicators) used to measure leadership variables (X) are valid at the corrected item- total correlation (X1= 0,727; X2- 0,572; X3= 0,609; X4- 0,415; X5= 0,838; X6- 0,435; X7= 0,283; X8-0,414) larger than > 0,25-0,30 (corrected item- total correlation > 0. 25-0.30).

TABLE. 4 RESULTS OF VALIDITY TEST OF VARIABLE Y (SOCIETY PARTICIPATION) ITEM-TOTAL STATISTICS

	Scale Mean if Item Deleted	Scale Variance if Item Deleted	Corrected Item-Total Correlation	Cronbach's Alpha if Item Deleted
Y1	8.93	3.682	.687	.593
Y2	8.76	4.083	.580	.660
Y3	8.99	4.535	.418	.752
Y4	8.39	4.705	.482	.715

Sources: analysis of research results 2019

Based on the table of analysis validity test results above, it is known that 4 items (society participations indicators) are used to measure the participatory variable society (Y) stated that valid of corrected item-total correlation (Y1= 0,687; Y2- 0.580; Y3- 0,418; Y4= 0.482) greater than > 0,25-0,30 (corrected item- total correlation > 0,25-0,30).

2) Reability Test

To maintain the strength from an instrument of using reliability test, where the instrument which performed the reliability test is an instrument that is declared valid, whereas the instrument is not valid then cannot be done by

reliability test. The maximum reliability use the formula Alpha Cronbach with the SPSS 16. 0. A construct or a variable is considered a reliabel if it gives the value of the Cronbach Alpha > 0,60.

TABLE. 5 RESULTS OF VARIABLE REABILITY TEST OF VARIABLE X (LEADERSHIP) RELIABILITY STATISTICS

Cronbach's Alpha	N of Items
80.9	8

Sources: Analysis of research results data at 2019

Based on the table of reliability statistics above, research questionnaires used to measure the leadership variable (X) is said to be reliabel because Cronbach Alpha is acquired by 0,809 greater than 0,60 (0,809 > 0,60).

TABLE. 6 RESULTS OF THE REABILITY TEST OF VARIABLE Y (SOCIETY PARTICIPATION) RELIABILITY STATISTICS

Cronbach's Alpha	N of Items
.744	4

Sources: data analysis of results research in 2019

Based on the reliability statistics table above, some of the detection of research has to describe the variabel of the society (Y) is said to be reliabel because Cronbach Alpha is 0,744 that mean greater than 0,60 (0,744> 0,60).

The simple data regression analysis shows that there is a real influence (significant) between the leadership of the village 's with the society participation in the development planning in Pattondon Salu 's village, Maiwa sub-district, Enrekang regency. This is proved by the results of test hypothesis. Which has been conducted using a simple regression analysis with SPSS 16. 0 for windows which indicates the value of the correlation/ relation (R) is a 0.471.

III. CONCLUSIONS

A result of research and discussion have been analyzed, can be conclude that:

1. The leadership of the government of Pattondon Salu's village on Maiwa sub-district, Enrekang regency, include: fair, give suggestions, support of the goal, catalyst, creating a peaceful, as a representative of the organization, the source of inspiration and respect each other. Based on the research results with frequency tabulation analysis on variable of X (leadership), so obtained the average percentage was 63,95% which categorized as good category.
2. Optimalisation the society participation on construction planning village of Pattondon Salu's village, Maiwa sub-district, Enrekang regency, includes: participation in identification problem, participation in decision taking, participation in implementation and evaluation. Based on research results by tabulation frequencies on the variable Y (society participation), the result of average percentage was 58,95% which included as good categories.

IV. ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The researchers addressed many thanks to *Kementerian Riset, Teknologi, dan Pendidikan Tinggi (RISTEKDIKTI), Direktorat Jenderal Penguatan Riset dan Pengembangan, Indonesia*, for *Hibah Penelitian Dosen Pemula 2019 (PDP)* scheme to funded and supported in doing research and publication.

REFERENCES

- [1] Sinambela, Lijan, Poltak. (2016). *Reformasi Pelayanan Publik: Teori, Kebijakan dan Implementasi*. Jakarta: PT. Bumi Aksara
- [2] Siagian, Sondang P. (2015). *Teori dan Praktek Kepemimpinan*. Jakarta :Rineka Cipta
- [3] I. Irwan, A. Latif, S. Sofyan, A. Mustanir, and F. Fatimah, "Gaya Kepemimpinan, Kinerja Aparatur Sipil Negara dan Partisipasi Masyarakat Terhadap Pembangunan Di Kecamatan Kulo Kabupaten Sidenreng Rappang," *MODERAT J. Ilm. Ilmu Pemerintah*. Univ. Galuh Ciamis, vol. 5, no. 1, pp. 32–43, 2019.
- [4] Wahjosumidjo. (2006). *Kepemimpinan yang Efektif*. Yogyakarta: Balai Pustaka
- [5] A. Damis Dadda, A. Mustanir, A. Nilwana, and J. Ahmad, "Pengaruh Kepemimpinan Lurah Perempuan Terhadap Stabilitas Kamtibmas Di Kelurahan Rappang Kabupaten Sidenreng Rappang," in *Konferensi Nasional Ke-8 Asosiasi Program Pascasarjana Perguruan Tinggi Muhammadiyah Aisyiyah (APPTMA)*, 2019, pp. 378–383.
- [6] A. Mustanir and I. Jaya, "PENGARUH KEPEMIMPINAN DAN BUDAYA POLITIK TERHADAP PERILAKU PEMILIH TOWANI TOLOTANG DI KECAMATAN MARITENGGAE KABUPATEN SIDENRENG RAPPANG," *J. Polit. Profetik*, vol. 04, no. 1, pp. 84–97, 2016.
- [7] A. Mustanir, H. Dema, H. Syarifuddin, K. Meity, and S. Wulandari, "Pengaruh Motivasi dan Partisipasi Masyarakat terhadap Pembangunan di Kelurahan Lalebata Kecamatan Panca Rijang Kabupaten Sidenreng Rappang," *J. Ilm. Clean Gov.*, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 27–39, 2018.
- [8] A. Mustanir, K. Sellang, A. Ali, M. Madaling, and M. Mutmainna, "PERANAN APARATUR PEMERINTAH DESA DAN PARTISIPASI MASYARAKAT DALAM MUSYAWARAH PERENCANAAN PEMBANGUNAN DI DESA TONRONGNGE KECAMATAN BARANTI KABUPATEN SIDENRENG RAPPANG," *J. Ilm. Clean Gov.*, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 67–84, 2018.
- [9] Umar, A., Madani, M., Farida, U., Yusriadi, Y., Tamsa, H., Yahya, M., ... & Sakkir, G. (2019). *ONE-STOP SERVICE POLICY AS A BUREAUCRATIC REFORM IN INDONESIA*. *Academy of Strategic Management Journal*, 18(2), 1-12.
- [10] Solekhan, M. (2014). *Penyelenggaraan Pemerintahan Desa Berbasis Masyarakat*. Malang: Setara Press
- [11] A. Mustanir and S. Lubis, "Participatory Rural Appraisal in Deliberations of Development Planning," in *International Conference On Democracy, Accountability, and Governance (ICODAG 2017)*, 2017, vol. 163, no. Icodag, pp. 316–319.
- [12] Dudgeon, Pat; Clair Scrine; Adele Cox; Roz Walker. (2017). *Facilitating Empowerment and Self-Determination Through Participatory Action Research: Findings From the National Empowerment Project*. Reprints and permissions: sagepub.com/journalsPermissions.nav DOI: 10.1177/1609406917699515. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods* Volume 16: 1–11
- [13] A. Mustanir, P. Abadi, and A. Nasri, "Participation of Ethnic Community Towani Tolotang in Deliberation of Development Plan," in *International Conference on Ethics in Governance (ICONEG 2016)*, 2016, vol. 84, pp. 356 – 359.
- [14] Khayesi, Melekidzedeck (ed). (2018). *Rural Development Planning in Africa*. Palgrave Macmillan imprint is Published by Springer Nature. ISBN 978-1-349-95296-0 ISBN 978-1-349-95297-7 (eBook). <https://doi.org/10.1057/978-1-349-95297-7>
- [15] H. Mustanir, Ahmad; Barisan, Barisan; Hamid, "Participatory Rural Appraisal As The Participatory Planning Method Of Development Planning," in *Indonesian Association for Public Administration (IAPA) International Conference Towards Open Government: Finding the Whole Government Approach, 2017*, pp. 77–84.
- [16] A. Mustanir and A. Yasin, "Community Participation in Transect on Development Planning," *J. Ilm. Ilmu Adm. Publik J. Pemikir. dan Penelit. Adm. Publik*, vol. 8, no. 2, pp. 137–146, 2018.
- [17] P. Mustanir, Ahmad; Abadi, "PARTISIPASI MASYARAKAT DALAM MUSYAWARAH RENCANA PEMBANGUNAN DI KELURAHAN KANYUARA KECAMATAN WATANG SIDENRENG KABUPATEN SIDENRENG RAPPANG," *J. Polit. Profetik*, vol. 5, no. 2, pp. 247–261, 2016.
- [18] Solekhan, M. (2014). *Penyelenggaraan Pemerintahan Desa Berbasis Masyarakat*. Malang: Setara Press
- [19] Cislaghi, Beniamino; Diane Gillespie; Gerry Mackie. (2016). *Values Deliberation & Collective Action Community Empowerment in Rural Senegal*. Palgrave Macmillan imprint is Published by Springer Nature. ISBN 978-3-319-33755-5. ISBN 978-3-319-33756-2 (eBook). DOI 10.1007/978-3-319-33756-2
- [20] Kwasi, Michael Odei Erdiaw; Michael Yaw Acheampong. (2018). *Empowerment And Community Salience In Multi-Party Collaboration: Empirical Lessons For Development Planning*. Publisher : Routledge Taylor and Francis Group. *Development in Practice*, 28:7, 932–942. DOI: 10.1080/09614524.2018.1486805. VOL. 28, NO. 7, 932–942
- [21] A. Uceng, A. Ali, A. Mustanir, and N. Nirmawati, "Analisis Tingkat Partisipasi Masyarakat Terhadap Pembangunan Sumber Daya Manusia Di Desa Cemba Kecamatan Enrekang Kabupaten Enrekang," *J. MODERAT*, vol. 5, no. 2, pp. 1–17, 2019.
- [22] A. Mustanir, P. Abadi, and A. Nasri, "Participation of Ethnic Community Towani Tolotang in Deliberation of Development Plan," in *International Conference on Ethics in Governance (ICONEG 2016)*, 2016, vol. 84, pp. 356 – 359.
- [23] Coughlin, Steven S.; Selina A. Smith; Maria E. Fernandez. (2017). *Handbook of Community- Based Participatory Research*. Publisher Oxford University Press. ISBN 9780190652241 (e- book) | ISBN 9780190652258 (e- book) | ISBN 9780190652234.
- [24] A. Mustanir and P. Abadi, "PARTISIPASI MASYARAKAT DALAM MUSYAWARAH RENCANA PEMBANGUNAN DI KELURAHAN KANYUARA KECAMATAN WATANG SIDENRENG KABUPATEN SIDENRENG RAPPANG," *J. Polit. Profetik*, vol. 5, no. 2, pp. 247–261, 2017.
- [25] Quimbo, Maria Ana T.; John Erinorio M. Perez; Francisca O. Tan. (2018). *Community Development Approaches And Methods: Implications For Community Development Practice And Research*. ISSN: 1557-5330 (Print) 1944-7485 (Online). Publisher : Routledge Taylor and Francis Group. *Community Development*, 49:5, 589–603, DOI: 10.1080/15575330.2018.1546199. VOL. 49, NO. 5, 589–603
- [26] Usadolo, Sam Erevbenagie; Marc Caldwell. (2016). *A Stakeholder Approach to Community Participation in a Rural Development Project*. DOI: 10.1177/2158244016638132. sgo.sagepub.com
- [27] A. Mustanir and Rusdi. Muhammad, "Participatory Rural Appraisal (PRA) Sebagai Sarana Dakwah Muhammadiyah Pada Perencanaan Pembangunan Di Kabupaten Sidenreng Rappang," in *Konferensi Nasional Ke-8 Asosiasi Program Pascasarjana Perguruan Tinggi Muhammadiyah Aisyiyah (APPTMA)*, 2019, pp. 378–383.
- [28] Clark, Julie; Nicholas Wise. (2018). *Urban Renewal, Community and Participation Theory, Policy and Practice*. The Urban Book Series. Publisher Springer International. ISSN 2365-757X ISSN 2365-7588 (electronic) The Urban Book Series ISBN 978-3-319-72310-5 ISBN 978-3-319-72311-2 (eBook) <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-72311-2>
- [29] A. Mustanir, B. Barisan, and H. Hamid, "Participatory Rural Appraisal As The Participatory Planning Method Of Development Planning," in *Proceedings Indonesian Association for Public Administration (IAPA) International Conference Towards Open Government: Finding the Whole Government Approach, 2017*, pp. 77–84.
- [30] S. Sapri, A. Mustanir, M. Ibrahim, A. A. Adnan, and W. Wirfandi, "Peranan Camat dan Partisipasi Masyarakat Dalam Musyawarah Perencanaan Pembangunan Di Kecamatan Enrekang Kabupaten Enrekang," *MODERAT J. Ilm. Ilmu Pemerintah.*, vol. 5, no. 2, pp. 33–48, 2019.
- [31] A. Uceng, E. Erfina, A. Mustanir, and S. Sukri, "Partisipasi Masyarakat Dalam Musyawarah Perencanaan Pembangunan Di Desa Betao Riase Kecamatan Pitu Riawa Kabupaten Sidenreng Rappang," *MODERAT J. Ilm. Ilmu Pemerintah.*, vol. 5, no. 2, pp. 18–32, 2019.
- [32] A. Mustanir and S. Lubis, "Participatory Rural Appraisal in Deliberations of Development Planning," 2017.
- [33] Sugiyono. (2016). *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif, Kuantitatif, R & D*. Bandung: Alfabeta.